

2022 REVISED JUDGING CRITERIA EXPLAINED

The AGS Judging Committee has revised the Judging Criteria with the goal to reduce confusion and increase consistency. We have prepared the **same** new criteria on 3 forms so that Chapters may choose the version(s) that will be easiest to implement.

What do we mean by reducing confusion? Primarily the areas for confusion of the original judging criteria were the (a) use of both workmanship and craftsmanship and (b) the definition of originality versus creativity and artistry.

The New Criteria recognizes and addresses these overlapping criteria these with the following 4 criteria and defining them so that all judges can evaluate the entries looking at the criteria objectively and consistently.

THE NEW JUDGING CRITERIA

Four Criteria:

Overall Appearance	Craftsmanship	Difficulty/Level of Effort	Featured Technique/Theme
--------------------	---------------	----------------------------	--------------------------

Evaluate the above criteria based on:

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall appeal • Artistic design • Stands out from the competition (has that “wow” factor) • Originality and artistic creativity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attention to detail • Uniform quality of work • Overall impact not marred by obvious flaws • Gourd sits flat or hangs evenly • Finished look <p><i>*When class is multimedia, all techniques applied are to be evaluated for quality of craftsmanship</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Difficulty of techniques as applied • Design complex or intricate • Skill in multiple areas • Amount of effort required 	<p><i>Featured technique dominates, but other techniques may be allowed, if stated in show book.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Apply quality of craftsmanship for the specified technique • Theme or class description must be fulfilled • Overall impression created by the featured technique or theme
---	---	--	--

Our action plan includes written and online discussions with Judges to familiarize as many as we can reach with these new/reorganized criteria. In the meantime, the detailed form is a great reference for getting a head-start.

But the potential confusion related to the old forms didn't stop there.

With Option A – Detailed scoring, judges score each of the five criteria with 1 as low and 5 as high. The clerks total the scores given by the three judges and records the sum for each entry in that category/class. The entry with the highest total score is the winning entry in that category/class.

With Option B – Simplified scoring, judges score each of the two criteria with 1 as best, 2 as second best, 3 as third best. The clerks total the scores given by the three judges and records the sum for each entry in that category/class. The entry with the lowest score is the winning entry in that category/class.

At first glance you might think, well this is how we've always done it and never had a problem. Traveling judges may come from a Chapter that has always used the “other” method and may unintentionally be scoring the opposite of the other judges on his or her team.

The New Scoring Forms all use the same 1 to 5 rating scale with 5 being the highest rating. This consistent scoring will also be easier for traveling judges and avoid mistakes.

WHAT FORM SHOULD WE USE?

The formatting of all three versions of the actual forms is vertical. The “medium” and “small” versions include a column to the side for the judges to write comments for the entrant.

- The Detailed version of the judging form uses that second column for additional information that we think will be helpful for judges. It is titled “Things to Look For.” We think the detailed version makes an excellent reference for the judges. You can laminate it and the judges can have it on their clipboards and then use one of the two smaller versions of the form for the scoring each entry. Or, you can print the detailed form as a 2-part, NCR (no carbon required) form so that there is one copy for the chapter and the second is for the entrant.
- The Medium version includes the “evaluation based on” bullet points for each of the four criteria and a space next to each criterion for a comment (compliment or critique). It does not include the “things to look for” column
- The Short version includes the 4 criterion and one space for comments (compliments and critiques). This form, in particular, pairs well with a laminated copy of the detailed form on the clipboard.

HOW TO USE THE NEW JUDGING CRITERIA FORMS

With these NEW FORMS the scoring is 1 (lowest) to 5 (highest) for each of the four criteria for each entry. Using these criteria to judge each individual entry will result in consistent results. When each entry is scored based on its own merits the top 3 entries results will naturally be identified. The scores of each criterion will direct the judges on the areas to compliment and critique with the expectation that the artist will learn what they did well as well as where and why they lost points.

NEXT STEPS

What AGS Judging Committee will do next.

1. With this email we are sending Chapters the Detailed, Medium and Short versions of the New Judging Criteria. We have explained the rationale for revisions to the criteria. Chapters are able to choose which of the 3 versions to print and use at their next Competition.
2. AGS Certified Judges will receive the same information as well as the opportunity to participate in a deeper discussion of the implementation of each criterion with the goal of making the use of this new form seamless.
3. In recognition that not emails are successfully delivered or read we will also post this information on the AGS & Chapter Officers FB page and the AGS website.
4. We plan to follow-up by holding 2 (or more) Zoom meetings to discuss implementation at the Chapter level and with Judges.
5. Effective immediately, New Judge Training will include these criterion and forms.
6. You can expect an article in the Summer issue of the magazine and beyond to ensure a full uptake of the new criterion and forms.
7. We will send articles for your newsletters so that all of your members are also aware of this change.

What Chapters should do.

1. Distribute the information in this letter to your Board of Directors, Festival Committee and Competition Committee.
2. The Competition Chair and Festival Committee should meet and discuss the form to use and how they will implement it for their next Festival.
3. Identify a “Judging Champion” who will inform all of your chapter members who routinely assist with judging and clerking at your show since not judge and clerk volunteers at your show are AGS-trained (or even AGS members). He/she will want to inform and train them before or at the show.
4. Include new judging articles in your newsletters.
5. Prepare the forms for use